

## THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 26 January 2017 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated Friday, 20 January 2017.

Present: County Councillor Walsh (Lord Mayor).  
 County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Aubrey, Bale, Bowden, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Richard Cook, Cowan, Kirsty Davies-Warner, Chris Davis, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Elsmore, Evans, Ford, Goddard, Gordon, Govier, Graham, Groves, Hill-John, Hinchey, Holden, Howells, Hudson, Hunt, Hyde, Keith Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Knight, Lent, Lloyd, Magill, McEvoy, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, Rea, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Simmons, Stubbs, Thomas, Ben Thomas, Graham Thomas, Lynda Thorne, Walker, Weaver, Darren Williams and Woodman

### 120 : MINUTE SILENCE

A minute silence was observed by Members of City of Cardiff Council as a mark of respect following the deaths of Councillor Derrick Morgan Councillor for Llanrumney and former Lord Mayor of City & County of Cardiff who passed away on 20 January 2017; former Lord Mayor and former Councillor John Smith who passed away on 28 December 2016; and former Councillor Len Ackerman, Deputy Chair of Licensing and Public Protection Committee and Ward Councillor for Trowbridge and St Mellons who passed away on 2 December 2016.

Following the minute silence the Lord Mayor led the tributes, which were received, from local Ward colleagues, Group Leaders and Elected Members from across the chamber.

### 121 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillors Manzoor Ahmed; Ralph Cook; Goodway and Marshall.

### 122 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

No declarations of interest were received.

### 123 : MINUTES

The minutes of the last meeting 24 November 2016 were approved as a correct record subject to the inclusion of the personal explanation from Councillor McEvoy withdrawing comments made during the meeting.

### 124 : PETITIONS

The following petitions were received: -

1. Councillor Lent (Plasnewydd) – 95 signatures asking the Council to investigate the bad lighting and the potholes in Bangor Street.
2. Councillor Lent (Plasnewydd) – 13 signatures requesting Residents Parking in Arran Place.
3. Councillor Ben Thomas (Whitchurch) – Approx 900 signatures calling for the public toilets in Whitchurch to remain open.
4. Councillor Joe Boyle (Penylan) - 210 petitioning for a better traffic management scheme around the new Howardian Primary School to help reduce traffic disruption around the school.
5. Councillor Rea (Plasnewydd) – 1224 signatures calling on the Council not to close Wedal Road HWRC.
6. Councillor McGarry (Plasnewydd) – 24 signatures requesting Residents Parking in Upper Kinraig Street.
7. Councillor McEvoy – 361 signatures calling on the Council to enforce the 20mpg speed limits in the vicinity of schools; including park Road, Cae'r Graig and sections of Heol Isaf.
8. Councillor Gordon – 139 signatures calling on the Council to urgently address the traffic and parking problems in the vicinity of both Pwll Coch and Fitzalan Schools (Lawrenny Avenue) to ensure the safety of pupils.
9. Councillor Gordon – 108 signatures calling on the Council to address the lack of cycle provision on route to Pwll Coch school.
10. Councillor De'Ath – 24 signatures requesting Residents Parking – Roath Court Place.

#### 125 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

Question: *Oliver Owen*

What assurances can the governing Labour Administration give the people of Rhiwbina and north Cardiff that they will retain a household waste centre on Wedal Road?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

Wedal Road Household Waste Recycling Centre will remain open until we fulfil the following three commitments: we open a larger recycling facility at Lamby Way to complement the existing much larger facility at Bessemer Close in Leckwith, a free home-collection service for recyclable and reusable items that service the whole city is up and running, and a new reuse facility is opened that will receive and process reusable items and make them available back into the community at a reasonable charge.

Supplementary question: *Oliver Owen*

I would like to ask, with the planned expansion of Cardiff, certainly in the north of Cardiff, it is of great concern to many people, and I'm sure other Councillors in this room are aware of the concern locally. This will only put more pressure on the services required in the north of the city and, with a number of petitions that have

been signed, surely it would be expedient for the Labour Council to listen to the concerns of local people and maintain this facility on Wedal Road.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

If you see the Council papers today, you will see the amendment to a motion on Wedal Road that Labour has put forward, we refer to the fact that we want to actively explore a new site to serve the residents of the north of Cardiff.

Question: *Cadan ap Tomos*

What is your council's policy on street cleaning when the mess can cause a danger to the public, such as with broken glass?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

There is currently no specific policy on street cleaning when the waste can cause a damage to the public, such as with broken glass. However, resources are prioritised in order to respond to any such potential public-safety issues that are reported to the Council, including broken glass and discarded needles.

We endeavour to remove any such waste that is reported within two hours although, at weekends, resources are limited in the city centre and district centres. As a result, it can sometimes take 48 hours to remove it depending on the location.

Supplementary question: *Cadan ap Tomos*

Councillor, I was actually quite surprised to hear your answer because I've reported four separate instances of broken glass in and around Roath at the beginning of December but after nearly two months, they still have not been cleaned up. One of these sites was at the bottom of Claude Road. It had dumped black bags and a dumped car battery next to it, which were both cleaned up but the broken glass was not.

I'm sure that you will be aware that real injury can be caused by tripping onto broken glass, which is a distinct possibility given the state of the pavements in the area as well.

I'm guessing that your inability to clean up this broken glass in a timely manner is probably due to your decision to cut the regular community street sweeping, which was put in place by the last Lib Dem administration. It's no use to rely on litter *picking* to clean this up because you need a brush to clean up broken glass.

So will you, this evening, commit to reintroducing those community street sweepers in order that areas like Roath are properly kept clean? And will you look again at the way you prioritise these issues? Because it's clearly not working.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I'm sorry to hear that the glass hasn't been cleared. And if you contact me directly, I'm more than happy to have a look at what the problem is. As far as I'm concerned, that should have been dealt with.

I note what you say about the previous Lib Dem administration, which I'm sure you've got no contact with and it's just a concern as a citizen of this county. However, what we find is that we're actually needing to clear up things. Street cleaners, although they look very good, are not particularly efficient in terms of the speed that they're able to go round the city. And we need to do things in a much quicker way. And if you notice nowadays with the blitz of the inner-city wards in particular, there's a much more deep clean taking place and things like broken glass are dealt with quickly. However, if there's glass on the particular highway that can be seen as a danger, especially to children or something like that, then I would expect that to be cleaned up much more quickly. So if it hasn't been, please let me know.

Question: *Michael Dean*

Can the cabinet member for transport please outline the actions he has taken to improve road safety in Radyr, following the recent terrifying incident outside Radyr Primary School whereby a car swerved to avoid a bus, mounted the pavement and came within inches of colliding with two small children and their parents?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I can't comment on the details of this specific incident, but the Council will assess whether there's been any incidents on this particular stretch of the road and consider implementing any necessary road measures accordingly, subject to funding being available.

Supplementary question: *Michael Deem*

I've been writing to you about this particular issue since March of last year, when it was discovered via a Freedom of Information request that a car was actually caught travelling 70mph past a primary school in Radyr. The story actually made front-page news in the Echo that month and rightly so.

Just to give you an update on any further accidents since then, there was actually a car crash on the pedestrian crossing in Heol Isaf in Radyr not so long ago and, obviously, the very disturbing incident I referred to in my question just before Christmas.

As of yet, we've had very little response from your office. But what's the most frustrating thing for me, aside from the inaction of this Council, is the fact that you continue to announce the rollout of extended 20mph zones from the city centre outwards without first addressing the urgent needs of the suburbs.

So my question is this: why have you not prioritised what I would describe as the high-risk areas – your schools, your youth clubs, your parks – for these 20mph zones before generically rolling it out from the city centre outwards? I see a lot going on in your own ward in Canton but I see very little in Radyr and Morganstown.

Reply: County Councillor Patel

I think it's important to understand the difference between 20mph limits and zones. What you've got is safer routes to schools, which is 20mph, which is what you're talking about. And what we are actually looking to introduce into Cardiff is the 20mph limits, which is example like Edinburgh and many other cities, like London, which have been introduced. The safer routes to schools will continue to happen. The 20mph limits is starting from the city centre and is going outwards that way. That's where the strategy is and that's where the evidence is.

But I think also what's important, as you're not the elected Member, I've been in correspondence with the elected Member of Radyr and what I can confirm is I've had site visits with the elected Member of Radyr as well and a road-scheme has been identified and will be implemented subject to a traffic order. And that's because I've been working closely with the elected Member of Radyr, which is Councillor Rod McKerlich.

126 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Lord Mayor made the following announcements: -

- Messages of Sympathy  
The Lord Mayor expressed sincere sympathy to Councillor Sarah Merry and Tariq Awan whose mothers passed away, and Councillor Bale whose grandmother passed way since the last meeting.
- Leader of the Opposition Group  
The Lord Mayor thanked Councillor Judith Woodman who had stepped down as Leader of the Liberal Democrats after over 4 years for her contributions as the Opposition Leader since 2012 and as Deputy Leader of the Council from 2004 to 2012.  
  
Group Leaders and Members from across the chamber paid tribute to the work of Councillor Woodman.
- Congratulations  
The Lord Mayor congratulated Councillor Ashley Govier and his partner Stephanie on the birth of their baby daughter Ivy.
- National Holocaust Memorial Day Service 2017  
The annual Memorial Day Service was to be held on Friday, 27 January, 2017 at 11:00am here at the City Hall. This year Eva Clarke and Arwel Michel will give key note speeches along with pupils who have participated in the Lessons to Auschwitz project. Representatives of faith and community groups will also take part in the service.
- Recognition and awards  
The Lord Mayor advised on recognition and awards received during the last month and congratulated teams on their achievements.

Celebrating staff achievements - a staff achievement ceremony, celebrating the accomplishments of officers in the Communities, Housing and Customer Service directorate was held at City Hall recently.

A number of staff representing a wide range of the directorate's services joined the Director, Sarah McGill, Assistant Director, Jane Thomas and other senior officers for an awards presentation to acknowledge their achievements.

Cardiff Story achieves great things - Congratulations to colleagues in The Cardiff Story Museum on their achievements recently in being nominated as an accessible attraction; one of four museums chosen by the Museum Association to feature a series of films; the awarding of the Gold Accolade by Visit Wales for an 'Outstanding and memorable experience for visitors in all aspects of the attraction'. This is the second year running that the museum have won this award.

- The Lord Mayor's Charity fundraising - has now reach a total of £65,450 and the Lord Mayor thanked the New Theatre staff; the Christmas Wrapping volunteers; and contributors to the Lord Mayor's Coffee morning and the annual Christmas Carol Concert for Members and Staff all of whom raised significant sums between them.

Councillor Dilwar Ali – the sponsorship for the Walk the Wall of China fundraising has hit £6,283. There is still an opportunity for people to donate or to be a sponsor on the T.Shirt that Dilwar and his cousin will wear. Please contact Dilwar for more information.

## 127 : SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING GUIDANCE

The Council was requested to receive the recommendations of the Cabinet and approve the Supplementary Planning Guidance on:

- Locating Waste Management facilities;
- Planning Obligations;
- Residential Design Guide; and
- Tall Buildings

The Cabinet Member, Transport, Planning and Sustainability Councillor Ramesh Patel proposed the report and Councillor Michael seconded.

The Council had a number of SPG's, which were prepared to supplement the policies contained in previous adopted plans. In order to ensure conformity with the recently adopted Cardiff Local Development Plan (LDP) policies, a review of these were underway and a programme of SPG to support and amplify the policies in the LPD was currently being produced. These SPG's were the second tranche of this programme and further tranches would be brought before Cabinet and Council in the next 12 months.

Welsh Government guidance encouraged local planning authorities to prepare SPG to provide advice on how LDP policies would be implemented. This should help

those involved in the development and planning process understand the purpose and objectives of policies and assist the submission of permissible planning applications. SPG must be consistent with planning legislation, Welsh Government guidance and the LDP. It should be prepared in consultation with the public and appropriate interests, and their views should be taken into account before formal Council approval. SPG may be given weight as a material consideration when making decisions on planning applications.

In September and October 2016 consultation was undertaken for six weeks on the SPG's in line with the LDP Community Involvement Scheme. Most of the comments received were minor and technical in nature.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the strategy. A number of issues were raised, including SPG's which set out the Council's approach to planning obligations when considering applications for development in Cardiff.

The Cabinet Member responded to the questions. He underlined the importance of the approved LDP in order to update the old SPG's.

RESOLVED – That the Supplementary Planning Guidance Locating Waste Management facilities; Planning Obligations; Residential Design Guide; and Tall Buildings were approved.

#### 128 : CARDIFF CAPITAL REGION CITY DEAL

The Council received a detailed report outlining the next steps for the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal. The report was seeking Council approval on the formal establishment of the Cardiff Capital Region Joint Committee, which would oversee the region's economic growth agenda and delivery of the 20 year Cardiff Capital Region City Deal; and approval of the Joint Working Agreement, Assurance Framework, Implementation Plan and Cardiff's role as the Accountable Body to enable the establishment of the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal.

The Leader of the Council, Councillor Bale, Cabinet Member for Economic Development and Partnerships proposed the report and Councillor Hinchey seconded.

The Council report of the 24 March 2016 outlined that the City Deal was signed in Cardiff on 15 March 2016 by the ten local authority leaders, the First Minister of Wales, the Welsh Government Minister for Finance, the Secretary of State for Wales and the Chief Secretary to HM Treasury.

The associated 'Heads of Terms' agreement outlined the parameters for the detailed development of the City Deal and set out how the ten local authorities would work in partnership with the Welsh Government and UK Government to support economic growth.

In order to progress enhanced regional working, and the establishment of the Investment Fund, the Heads of Terms outlined proposals to establish a Cardiff Capital Region governance model that:

- Complied with the existing statutory framework that exists in Wales to deliver the City Deal proposals;
- Strengthens and streamlines the existing governance and partnership arrangements across the Capital Region;
- Improves business involvement in local decision making;
- Provides confidence and assurance to both the UK and Welsh Governments that local authority leaders were making collective decisions which would serve to drive economic growth across the Capital Region; and
- Enables local authorities to explore with Welsh Government arrangements for local government reform in the medium term.

In particular, the development of the City Deal was reliant on the establishment of a Joint Committee comprising of the participating local authorities. This Joint Committee in the first instance would have collective responsibility for decisions relating to the agreed investment programme. However, it would also be the lead body for any local authority regional collaboration on issues highlighted within the City Deal Heads of Terms.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal. The Members were unanimously supportive of the City Deal, and that Cardiff was in a position to approve the deal. Similar Capital Region Deals were in place across the UK and it was envisaged that Cardiff City Deal would be as successful and improve Economic development across the board. Members felt the proposal would generate substantial funding for the ten local authorities, along with the development of the metro, a key element of the City Deal and would improve transport links across the city, including the electrification of the valley's lines. Some Members were of the view this was a once in a lifetime opportunity and hoped Cardiff and its partners would develop the City Deal opportunities similar to those offered in Manchester and Leeds.

RESOLVED – That the proposal to extend the debate for a further fifteen minutes was agreed.

Members continued to endorse and support the City Deal. The major transport infrastructure proposals were welcomed. The Governance and the implementation plan should be scrutinised accordingly in order to ensure that the appropriate Governance was in place. Members felt this was an opportunity for the region to share in the prosperity of the deal and ensuring a regional approach.

The Leader of the Council responded to the statements made and drew attention to the following. Appropriate Governance of the Region was being established and was essential to in order to monitor the projects going forward. Regional working would contribute towards supporting local government collaboration and was vital to take the regional economic policy forward in the future.

RESOLVED – That subject to the terms of the Joint Working Agreement the Council agreed the following in so far as it applies to each of their functions:

1. approve the Joint Working Agreement (Appendix C) as the legal document that



formally establishes the Cardiff Capital Region Joint Cabinet (the Regional Cabinet) as a Joint Committee, with delegated functions, with a Commencement Date of the 1<sup>st</sup> March 2017. The elected member representative to the Regional Cabinet shall be the Leader of the council, or his/her nominated Deputy.

2. approve, the financial contributions towards the collective £120m total, (together with such associated costs e.g. carry costs), as detailed in paragraph 94 of this report.
3. approve the carry forward of any remaining revenue funds from 16/17, contributed by each Council, into 17/18 in order that the support structure for the Joint Committee continues.
4. approve the collective revenue contributions of up to £1 million (inclusive of recommendation (c) above, on a proportionate basis as set out in the Joint Working Agreement) to the 17-18 budget, in order that the support structure for the Regional Cabinet continues.
5. approve that the City of Cardiff Council acting as the Accountable Body with the responsibilities as set out in the Joint Working Agreement.
6. approve the Assurance Framework as the open and transparent, robust decision making process for considering all proposals requiring support from the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal Wider Investment Fund.
7. approve the Implementation Plan in the form attached to the Joint Working Agreement, subject to each council approving the Joint Working Agreement Business Plan.
8. the Chief Executive in consultation with the Leader of the Council, the Monitoring Officer and s151 Officer be granted delegated authority to agree such amendments as are necessary to the Joint Working Agreement, Assurance Framework and Implementation Plan (as are appropriate) from the date of acceptance of these recommendations to the Commencement Date of the 1<sup>st</sup> March, 2017.
9. the Chief Executive in consultation with the Leader of the Council, the Monitoring Officer and s151 Officer be granted delegated authority to decide whether the Council should continue to explore the opportunity in the CCR City Deal in the event that one or more of the 10 Constituent Councils fail to agree any of recommendations (a) to (g) above.
10. the Leader of the Council or his/her nominated Deputy be granted delegated authority to sign the Joint Working Agreement on behalf of the Council.

129 : STATEMENTS

The Leader Statement Economic Development & Partnerships.

The Leader provided a statement on the Cardiff Business Improvement District. The official launch of the Cardiff Business Improvement District (BID) took place on 30 November 2016. Cardiff BID will be investing £7.5m into the city over the next five years to help in the transformation of Cardiff.

The Cardiff BID team worked in partnership with the Council and South Wales Police to support Operation Mistletoe during the Christmas period and is working with the Council on an intensive street cleaning programme in the city centre. Cardiff BID is also liaising with BT to investigate the possibility of upgrading the area to superfast broadband, which will increase digital connectivity for both workers and visitors.

The Leader's statement also included details on other projects and developments including the two prestigious global business awards won by Economic Development. The Cardiff Capital Region Growth & Competitiveness Commission Report, the independent report on the future economic strategy for South-East Wales was published on 16 December 2016. The report had been endorsed by the Cardiff Capital Region Shadow Joint Cabinet, which had also accepted unanimously the need to develop the recommended regional economic growth strategy with immediate effect. It also included information on the Liveable City Forum, Bilingual Cardiff: Five Year Strategy, UEFA Champions League Finals and the Maelfa Regeneration scheme.

Liveable City forum, proposals on the LPD increase projected with cars on the roads. Feedback on operation Mistletoe being available. Maelfa regeneration event

Community Development, Co-operatives and Social Enterprise Statement.

The Cabinet Member provided an update on the new Llandaff North and Gabalfa Hub opened its doors on Thursday, January 12 at 10am, providing the local community with more and better services on their doorstep.

The former Llandaff North Library and Day Centre have been completely refurbished and re-designed to create the hub which brings services together to meet the needs and priorities of the community while making it easier and more convenient for customers to engage with the City Council.

Skills, Safety and Engagement Statement

The Cabinet Member provided an update on Adult Community Learning, where notification from the department for Education and Skills had been received by the Council's Adult Community Learning Team had achieved a 94% success rate for 2015/16 learner outcomes.

The Cabinet Member's statement also included updates on Into Work Advice Service and the British Deaf Association.

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on the minimum qualifications for teachers teaching deaf students and was there a minimum qualification.

#### Health, Housing and Wellbeing Statement

The Cabinet Member provided a statement on the Regional Partnership Board. As Chair of the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Regional Partnership Board, I am pleased to report the good progress achieved across the region in implementing Part 9 of the Social Services and Well Being (Wales) Act 2014 (SSWB) (Co-operation and Partnership). The newly formed board arrangements (established in April 2016) are supporting effective collaboration across a number of key areas. Among the issues under active consideration at its third meeting on 12<sup>th</sup> January 2017 were the following:

- Population Needs Assessment
- Joint Commissioning and Pooled Budgets
- Integrated Autism Strategy
- Delayed Transfer of Care (DToCs)

The Cabinet Member's statement also made reference to, Dementia – Missing Persons Pilot Project, Right to Buy Consultation, Rough Sleepers and House Building Programme – Cardiff Living.

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on Rough Sleepers Strategy (Staff involved) and finance evictions.

#### Early Years, Children and Families Statement

The Cabinet Member provided a statement on Children's Services update in relation to the implementation of Signs of Safety Project Plan. The statement also included information on Mobile Working, MASH (Multi Agency Safeguarding Hub, Edge of Care Initiatives, Child Sexual Exploitation Strategy and Disability Futures Programme.

#### Education Statement

The Cabinet Member provided a statement Cardiff Council wins CAVC Partnership Award. At the Annual Cardiff and Vale Awards Ceremony, Cardiff Local Authority was presented with the Business and Partner Award for its partnership work in developing the Junior Apprenticeship Programme and the Post-16 developments at Eastern High School. School Performance, Since 2013, there has been an acceleration in the performance of Cardiff schools across all phases of education. In 2016, the city performed above the national averages in a wide range of performance indicators and there has been improvement in a number of areas.

The Cabinet statement also included information on Additional Learning Needs (ALN) Reform, School Catering Managers ILM Level 3/4, Computing Unlocked, Partnerships, "Inspire" Anti-bullying Awards, Cantonian and Willows High School.

The Statement also made reference to Governance, LA Governor panel, Director of Education's Strategic Briefing with Chairs of Governors and Looked After Children Awards.

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on Cantonian High School, School Performance, Education out of School, School Performance position, Super Blocks in schools.

#### Environment Statement

The Cabinet Members statement included information on the Parks, Bereavement, Cardiff Dogs, Recycling & Treatment Services and Neighbourhood Services.

#### Corporate Services and Performance Statement

The Cabinet Members statement included the Council's Academy which had retained its status as an accredited centre for Service Improvement following inspection by Cardiff University's Lean Enterprise Research Centre. The accreditation means that the Academy can continue to offer Service Improvement/Lean Management training to Council staff. For the first time, the accreditation will allow the Academy to offer other Service Improvement training to other public sector bodies.

The statement also made reference to the Living Wage Council, C2C, Website, Secure IT Services, Health & Safety and Strategic Estates – Operational Estate.

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on, Living Wage Council and organisations supporting the Living Wage

#### 130 : MOTION 1

The Lord Mayor advised that a notice of motion proposed by Councillor McEvoy and seconded by Councillor Awan had been received in accordance with the Council procedure rules and was included on the Summons for the meeting.

The Notice of Motion as proposed by Councillor McEvoy was as follows:

1. This Council in principle notes:
  - i. The enormous environmental damage planned through Cardiff's Local Development Plan.
  - ii. The contradiction between the stated regional outlook of Welsh Government Policy and the individual nature of local authority planning through local development plans.
  - iii. The contradictions between the stated goals and principles of the Well Being of Future Generations Act and the reality which Cardiff's Local Development Plan will bring to the City.
  - iv. In particular this Council notes that results of Cardiff's Local Development Plan will fly in the face of:
    - a) A globally responsible Wales

- b) A healthier Wales, especially in light of no extra beds being projected to be provided in the University Hospital of Cardiff
  - c) A prosperous Wales
  - d) A Wales of Vibrant culture and thriving Welsh language
  - e) A Wales of cohesive communities
  - f) A resilient Wales
  - g) A more equal Wales
2. This Council is of the view that Cardiff's Local Development is not in keeping with sustainable development:
- i. The destruction of green field space and woodland will:
    - a) Will endanger wildlife
    - b) Will make Cardiff more susceptible to flooding
    - c) Will increase Cardiff's carbon footprint
    - d) Will reduce the quality of already poor air
    - e) Will substantially increase the number of cars on Cardiff's road network, whilst there are no firm plans for upgraded public transport infrastructure.
3. The Council is clear in its view that the population figures used to justify housing growth prior to the Brexit Referendum need revisiting in light of the projected change in immigration policy.
4. This Council call on officers to draw up a report to be completed between 4th May 2017 and the end of June 2017, with full financial implications in order to use Section 68 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act to ask the Welsh Government to revoke Cardiff's Local Development Plan.

Councillor Ford formally seconded the motion.

The Lord Mayor advised that there was one amendment to the motion proposed by Councillor Rea and seconded by Councillor Boyle as follows: -

Remove all of point 4

*"This Council calls on officers to draw up a report to be completed between 4<sup>th</sup> May 2017 and the end of June 2017, with full financial implications in order to use Section 68 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act to ask the Welsh Government to revoke Cardiff's Local Development Plan."*

And replace with

*'This Council believes that a major review of Cardiff's Local Development Plan should be undertaken as soon as possible.*

*This Council therefore calls on officers to produce a report to be completed between 8th May 2017 and the end of June 2017, on the financial and legal implications of conducting a major review of Cardiff's Local Development Plan in the financial year 2017/18.'*

The substantive Motion will read:

1. This Council in principle notes:

- i. The enormous environmental damage planned through Cardiff's Local Development Plan.
  - ii. The contradiction between the stated regional outlook of Welsh Government Policy and the individual nature of local authority planning through local development plans.
  - iii. The contradictions between the stated goals and principles of the Well Being of Future Generations Act and the reality which Cardiff's Local Development Plan will bring to the City.
  - iv. In particular this Council notes that results of Cardiff's Local Development Plan will fly in the face of:
    - a) A globally responsible Wales
    - b) A healthier Wales, especially in light of no extra beds being projected to be provided in the University Hospital of Cardiff
    - c) A prosperous Wales
    - d) A Wales of Vibrant culture and thriving Welsh language
    - e) A Wales of cohesive communities
    - f) A resilient Wales
    - g) A more equal Wales
2. This Council is of the view that Cardiff's Local Development is not in keeping with sustainable development:
- i. The destruction of green field space and woodland will:
    - a) Will endanger wildlife
    - b) Will make Cardiff more susceptible to flooding
    - c) Will increase Cardiff's carbon footprint
    - d) Will reduce the quality of already poor air
    - e) Will substantially increase the number of cars on Cardiff's road network, whilst there are no firm plans for upgraded public transport infrastructure.
3. The Council is clear in its view that the population figures used to justify housing growth prior to the Brexit Referendum need revisiting in light of the projected change in immigration policy.
4. This Council believes that a major review of Cardiff's Local Development Plan should be undertaken as soon as possible.

This Council therefore calls on officers to produce a report to be completed between 8th May 2017 and the end of June 2017, on the financial and legal implications of conducting a major review of Cardiff's Local Development Plan in the financial year 2017/18.'

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the motion. At the conclusion of the debate, the Lord Mayor invited Councillor McEvoy to sum up.

RESOLVED: Councillor Hinchey proposed that the question be put this was seconded by Councillor Elsmore. The vote was **CARRIED**.

For (34)

Councillors Ahmed, Magill, Huw Thomas, Stubbs, Derbyshire, Patel, Richard Cook, Michael, Parry, De'Ath, Hinchey, Weaver, Murphy, Ben Thomas, McGarry, Hunt, Mitchell, Elsmore, Phillips, Goddard, Bale, Darren Williams, Knight, Gordon, Dilwar Ali, Davis, Simmons, Wild, Merry, Bradbury, Keith Jones, Lent, Sanders and Bridges.

Against (23)

Councillors Graham Thomas, Robson, Cowan, Dianne Rees, Walker, Hudson, Graham, Hill-John, Holden, Howells, Lloyd, David Rees, Boyle, Davies-Warner, Woodman, Clark, Kelloway, Carter, Hyde, Chaundy, Rea, Awan, Ford, McEvoy and Govier.

Councillor McEvoy was allowed the right to reply.

A vote was taken on the amendment as proposed by Councillor Rea. The Vote was **LOST**.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the motion as proposed by Councillor McEvoy. The Motion was **LOST**.

131 : MOTION 2

The Lord Mayor advised that the second notice of motion proposed by Councillor Clark and seconded by Councillor Rea had been received in accordance with the Council procedure rules and was included on the Summons for the meeting.

This Council notes that:

- Welsh Government Statistics have found that fly-tipping in Cardiff increased by 59% in 2015/16 (6,214 incidents) compared to the previous year. Clearing this fly-tipping cost Cardiff Council more than £410,000 last year, nearly a quarter of all money spent on fly-tipping in Wales.
- The fly-tipping figures have been aggravated by the closure of the Waungron Road Household Waste Recycling Centre in April 2014
- Urgent action is needed to address Cardiff's fly-tipping problems

This motion therefore calls for:

- Increased street sweeping, particularly after the waste collection day
- The full reintroduction of free bulky waste item collections
- Tough action on fly-tippers and those who dump waste
- Lobbying of the Welsh Government for approval to increase the fines on those who fly-tip
- An increased number of suppliers of recycling bags

- Expansion of the number of household waste recycling centres so that there are at least four across the city, including at Wedal Road.”

A report on the matter should be prepared for consideration by the Executive and or Council as appropriate”

The Lord Mayor advised that there were two amendments to the motion the first proposed by Councillor Cowan and seconded by Councillor Hudson as follows: -

Under the first paragraph which starts 'This Council notes that:' add two additional bullet points at the end as follows: -

- *Resources need to be targeted to ensure that officers can actively pursue individuals who fly-tip and litter, ensuring fines are collected.*
- *Two large petitions were submitted to this Council on behalf of thousands of residents who want to safeguard the future of Wedal Road. We wish to see a statement from the Cabinet Member securing the future of this much needed and used provision.*

The substantive motion would read:

This Council notes that:

- Welsh Government Statistics have found that fly-tipping in Cardiff increased by 59% in 2015/16 (6,214 incidents) compared to the previous year. Clearing this fly-tipping cost Cardiff Council more than £410,000 last year, nearly a quarter of all money spent on fly-tipping in Wales.
- The fly-tipping figures have been aggravated by the closure of the Waungron Road Household Waste Recycling Centre in April 2014.
- Urgent action is needed to address Cardiff's fly-tipping problems.
- Resources need to be targeted to ensure that officers can actively pursue individuals who fly-tip and litter, ensuring fines are collected.
- Two large petitions were submitted to this Council on behalf of thousands of residents who want to safeguard the future of Wedal Road. We wish to see a statement from the Cabinet Member securing the future of this much needed and used provision.

This motion therefore calls for:

- Increased street sweeping, particularly after the waste collection day
- The full reintroduction of free bulky waste item collections



- Tough action on fly-tippers and those who dump waste
- Lobbying of the Welsh Government for approval to increase the fines on those who fly-tip
- An increased number of suppliers of recycling bags
- Expansion of the number of household waste recycling centres so that there are at least four across the city, including at Wedal Road.”

A report on the matter should be prepared for consideration by the Executive and or Council as appropriate”

Amendment 2 was proposed by Councillor Derbyshire and seconded by Councillor Lent.

The deletion of all words after ‘This Council notes that:’

- Welsh Government Statistics have found that fly tipping in Cardiff....

and replace with:

*.....decreased in 2015/16 (6,214) by 44% compared to 2011/12 (11,185) the last year of the Lib Dem/Plaid administration.*

- *Prior to the closure of Waungron Road the average tonnage of fly tipping removed was 23 tons per week, following the closure the tonnage removed was 22 tons per week showing the closure have had no detrimental impact on fly tipping.*
- *Cardiff Labour controlled council continues to improve its collection of fly tipping. In the current year, Cardiff is set to record its best ever figures of 98% of all reported fly tipping being removed within the statutory 5 working days. This is a year on year improvement since the Labour administration took control.*

*This motion therefore calls for:*

- *Continuation of the deep clean that has cleared over 350 streets and 2,800 gullies since the start of the process.*
- *Continuation of the free household collection of bulky recyclable materials as shown on the Council website.*
- *Tough action on fly tippers and those who dump waste.*
- *Lobbying Welsh Government for approval to set the fines on those who fly tip, currently Councils can only prosecute offenders.*
- *Lobbying Welsh Government to give Councils more powers to take enforcement action against fly tippers.*

- *Continue to provide free green bags and food bags for Cardiff residents.*
- *Continue to give full support to local Councillors and groups who have been working hard to clean up their own area as part of the “Love where you Live” campaign.*
- *Review of the number of household waste recycling centres in line with the predicted growth of the City.*

*This Council calls on the Labour administration to commit to the above actions for the year 2017/18.*

The Substantive Motion would read:

This Council notes that:

- Welsh Government Statistics have found that fly tipping in Cardiff decreased in 2015/16 (6,214) by 44% compared to 2011/12 (11,185) the last year of the Lib Dem/Plaid administration.
- Prior to the closure of Waungron Road the average tonnage of fly tipping removed was 23 tons per week, following the closure the tonnage removed was 22 tons per week showing the closure have had no detrimental impact on fly tipping.
- Cardiff Labour controlled council continues to improve its collection of fly tipping. In the current year, Cardiff is set to record its best ever figures of 98% of all reported fly tipping being removed within the statutory 5 working days. This is a year on year improvement since the Labour administration took control.

This motion therefore calls for:

- Continuation of the deep clean that has cleared over 350 streets and 2,800 gullies since the start of the process.
- Continuation of the free household collection of bulky recyclable materials as shown on the Council website.
- Tough action on fly tippers and those who dump waste.
- Lobbying Welsh Government for approval to set the fines on those who fly tip, currently Councils can only prosecute offenders.
- Lobbying Welsh Government to give Councils more powers to take enforcement action against fly tippers.
- Continue to provide free green bags and food bags for Cardiff residents

- Continue to give full support to local Councillors and groups who have been working hard to clean up their own area as part of the “Love where you Live” campaign.
- Review of the number of household waste recycling centres in line with the predicted growth of the City.

This Council calls on the Labour administration to commit to the above actions for the year 2017/18.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the motion. At the conclusion of the debate, the Lord Mayor invited Councillor Clark to sum up.

A vote was taken on the amendment as proposed by Councillor Cowan. The Vote was **LOST**.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the motion as proposed by Councillor Derbyshire. The Motion was **CARRIED**

This Council agrees the following:

- Continuation of the deep clean that has cleared over 350 streets and 2,800 gullies since the start of the process.
- Continuation of the free household collection of bulky recyclable materials as shown on the Council website.
- Tough action on fly tippers and those who dump waste.
- Lobbying Welsh Government for approval to set the fines on those who fly tip, currently Councils can only prosecute offenders.
- Lobbying Welsh Government to give Councils more powers to take enforcement action against fly tippers.
- Continue to provide free green bags and food bags for Cardiff residents
- Continue to give full support to local Councillors and groups who have been working hard to clean up their own area as part of the “Love where you Live” campaign.
- Review of the number of household waste recycling centres in line with the predicted growth of the City.

132 : ORAL QUESTIONS

Question: *County Councillor Rea*

Are you satisfied that the European Commission Urban Audit 'satisfied to live in' ranking is a robust measure of liveability?

Reply: County Councillor Bale

I am satisfied that the European Commission's Urban Audit is a robust measure of liveability.

Cardiff emerged as one of the top cities for quality of life, and what Cardiffian wouldn't agree with that?

I have set an ambition for Cardiff to become Europe's most liveable capital city and it's important to be setting a bold goal objective that it is measurable.

The question on life satisfaction is a key measure in the survey and best captures – in a simple way – how people feel about life in Cardiff.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Rea

The ranking on page 18 lists the capital cities of Europe that took part in this survey by the percentage of people who responded that they were satisfied to live here. However, Belfast does not appear on that list. Were you not aware that Belfast was a capital city? Belfast would appear above Cardiff in that list, so Cardiff would drop down from third place to fourth place just on that basis.

However, it gets slightly worse because within the 97% bit, those three cities that are in there, in the actual original report, they are ranked, if you have a look, not alphabetically, they are ranked if you look at the decimal points in that ranking, whereas it's been reordered in the Livable City report to reflect what Cardiff would like to be, which is at the top of that pile of three cities, not what the data actually shows so it would be sixth on the list.

So could you explain and perhaps learn the capitals?

Reply: County Councillor Bale

I am aware Belfast is aware and it's a question that's worth raising with the European Commission. They don't include Belfast in terms of their actual data when they are doing that ranking, which is an interesting ...

Yes, it is, but it's not in terms of the European Commission in terms of using cities, they don't include Belfast when they are ranking that. That's the advice that I've had from Officers. I'm happy to follow that up for you.

In terms of the report itself, there is a consultation on the report, and I'd encourage you to submit any views that you had in terms of the layout in future years.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor McEvoy

We have the European Commission Audit... Liveability, we are back to this. Because the Leader just minutes ago talked about the metro as almost a panacea to the huge increase in traffic that you will bring on this city with your Local well, Local Destruction Plan.

Now, as we heard earlier, there are no actual lines agreed with the metro, so any lines that do come on stream are going to be way into the future, when those developments will already be there. So how does developments in the west of the city, with no public-transport infrastructure, how do they tie in with the nonsense, frankly, that you talk about with this liveability?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

The metro is a Welsh Government initiative as you will be aware as an Assembly Member. We actually have got a process, a procurement process, with Welsh Government underway at the moment. There are several bidders, I understand, that have engaged in that process. And we'll get a much better understanding when that's concluded in due course in terms of what are going to be the priority projects that will come through the money that's available.

The metro is a long-term project but it's also complements a range of other things that we're doing in this city. You'll have seen the fantastic coverage that we've had around our cycling strategy consultation that we've launched recently. There's a whole range of other initiatives that we need to look at to get people out of their cars and into sustainable modes of transport. We've got that 50% target and we obviously want to get up to 60% by 2026.

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

Your administration has consistently talked about modernising the Council. Officer time preparing business cases for alternative delivery models has been costly but, to date, unproductive. The only outcome in five years has been a change in the management of Leisure Centres which is reportedly bedding down well but is at a very early stage. It is also reported that an alternative management model being considered for the New Theatre and St David's Hall has now stalled. Will you accept that Labour has failed in its pledge to modernise the Council, reduce subsidies and transform underperforming services?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

This administration has absolutely delivered on its pledge to modernise the Council, reduce subsidies and transform underperforming services.

Councillor, you rightly mentioned the work done to secure and safeguard the provision of leisure services but we've also secured the future of sport in Cardiff through a Joint Venture Agreement with Cardiff Metropolitan University; we've allowed customers to access our services more quickly through the Community Hubs programme; and, of course, enabled over 500 social workers, to date, to spend more time with clients thanks to remote-working arrangements.

The modernisation agenda hasn't stopped – it's still continuing. And that will certainly have helped contribute to us being the third most improved council in Wales.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Walker*

As the Leader will note, I've sited in particular the business cases for alternative delivery models and I don't see any outcome or any results or any savings having come from that at all. A lot of expenditure in waste management, which you are still allowing to be run internally. Performance is plateauing.

So exactly, on the big ones, and you mentioned sport and things like that, but on the very big issues, what savings have you managed to make?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

As you will know, having served on the Policy, Review, and Performance Committee, there is a three-year organisational development programme. That's very clear in terms of the need to commercialise services to improve the performance of services. The infrastructure services model that you touched upon went through quite an extensive process of identifying the best way to run those services, and we believe we're in a better position as a result of going through that exercise.

We've had the leisure centres procurement exercise that are currently now being managed under a 15-year agreement with Greenwich Leisure. And there is further work underway, most notably with St David's Hall and the New Theatre, which will be brought forward to Members in due course.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

The question pertains to the leisure centres, which you privatised. Are you concerned when staff tell me that they are on zero-hour contracts?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

Councillor McEvoy, if you've got evidence of what you're saying then by all means send it through to us and we'll consider that in due course. I have got every confidence in terms of the early management of that contract. It is a social enterprise. It's run through its staff and all of the indications are that we've got a partner here that's absolutely committed to investing in those staff and improving services, as well as improving the facilities that we've got right across the city.

Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

Can the Cabinet member give an update on the funding of the youth service in Cardiff?

Reply: *County Councillor Merry*

I can confirm that, in the current financial year 2016/17, the Council's gross expenditure on the Youth Service in Cardiff will amount to nearly £2m, or £1.946m.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

Are you aware that, since you took office – not you personally in your portfolio, but the Labour administration – that you have cut the youth budget in the city by 44%? Councillors here voted to close my youth centre at Waterhall, in an area with some challenges. You also took away the outreach workers. So do you not realise the damage that you've done to the city and the city's youth? That's the question.

Reply: *County Councillor Merry*

I would regret any cuts that this Council has had to make due to national government spending cuts. But we have our actually remaining services in 21 locations. What we have had to do is redesign the service, so we are now working with a range of partners, which include Cardiff City Foundation, it includes ACE, it includes Cathays Community Centre, it includes Full Circle Education. And in that way, we actually hope to protect the service long learning.

We are also investing in mentors in our schools, who are working very closely with vulnerable young people in a targeted way who are in danger of becoming not in employment, education, or training. And in that way, we have sought to protect both open-access provision across the city at a very challenging financial time and to reinforce our work with the most vulnerable children in our city.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Huw Thomas*

Councillor Merry, could you update the chamber on the progress that's been made with regard to the Welsh-language youth service, in particular with regard to the collaboration and discussion with Menter Caerdydd and, specifically, Urdd Gobaith Cymru?

Reply: *County Councillor Merry*

Just as we've worked with partners across the city, we have been working with Urdd, who are now operating our Welsh youth service.

Question: *County Councillor McGarry*

Could you tell me if the Civil Enforcement Officers are able to issue on-the-spot fines to people who drop any kind of litter or allow their dog to foul without picking it up?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

The short answer is yes, Civil Enforcement Officers are able to issue on-the-spot fines to people who drop litter or allow their dogs to foul, subject to them having received appropriate training. Neighbourhood Services are currently moving to a more streamlined electronic process using handheld devices for the printing of fixed penalty notices for litter and dog fouling offences. This means that, in the future, both Civil Enforcement Officers and Neighbourhood Services Enforcement Officers could play a multifunctional role in relation to issuing on-the-spot fines.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor McGarry*

Is there a timescale for when they'll have the training to be able to do this? Because the more we catch these people that are dropping their litter, the less litter we'll have on our streets. And I know that the park wardens can already do it and are fining people for dropping litter.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I think the issue for the moment is the digitalisation. At the moment, Civil Enforcement Officers go and give a ticket for a car, you can't just do that when you're fining someone if their dog's fouling or littering. So what we want to make sure is that we've got, as I said, the electronic process in place so they've got handheld devices. Once that happens, which hopefully will be some time later this year, then the intention will be to train up officers to be more multifunctional.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

I wonder if you'd outline to Council the process for, first of all, issuing Section 46 notices and then proceeding to prosecution. If you could outline the process, I'd be grateful.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

We don't issue Section 46 notices for dropping litter.

Question: *County Councillor Boyle*

Has the Labour administration met its 2012 manifesto commitment to make Cardiff a NEETS-free city?

Reply: *County Councillor Merry*

Since 2012, the number of young people not in employment, education, or training has more than halved. For example, year 11 pupils the figure has reduced from 6.7% in 2012 to an indicative figure of 3%, which is under 100 pupils, in 2016.

We will continue to support youth engagement and progression through the "Cardiff Commitment", which will include an increase in the number of traineeships and apprenticeships offered by the Council.

We've also developed an innovative junior apprenticeship scheme aimed at young people aged 14-16 who are deemed to be potentially in danger of dropping out of education and training at 16.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Boyle*

Is that 3% the figure for the latest year, or are we still waiting for them? Perhaps if you could just clarify that, because there does seem to be a delay on that. More importantly is why has this manifesto commitment proven such a hard nut to crack?

Reply: *County Councillor Boyle*



The 3% figure is an indicative figure, which won't actually be formally announced until March. I'm assuming, as they've put in my information on my sheet, that I'm allowed to give it out in the chamber but it's an indicative figure.

It is a hard nut to crack and it was a very, very ambitious pledge. I'm very proud of the fact that we have halved the number of people who are not in employment, education, or training. I think there's multiple issues within that figure, isn't there? There's a significant number of young people who actually are not in a position to go into employment, education, or training because of health issues. There are also a number who are either pregnant or who have just become parents, is another strand. And as we freely have admitted, that there is still an issue with underperformance at certain of our secondary schools. And if young people are leaving without the qualifications that they need, then they will almost inevitably end up not in education, employment, or training.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

I just wondered what specific courses are available for NEETS in the city. Which organisations do you work with to pursue those courses? And how many are there resulting apprenticeships?

Reply: *County Councillor Merry*

Well, obviously any course is potentially open to a young person at the age of 16 to enter.

That's a question that's without an answer, isn't it Neil? Because any course is potentially available for a young person to actually enter. Perhaps if you'd like to email me something more specific, but any young person in this city can potentially go onto a training course to do with multiple subjects. I can't be specific when you don't ask a specific question.

Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

What is Cardiff doing to mitigate the changes in benefits of people in Cardiff?

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

As Members who attended the briefing session on welfare reform in November will know, a great deal of proactive work is taking place to support those affected by welfare reform.

Those affected by the Bedroom Tax have priority on the housing waiting list. In the first three quarters of this financial year, 485 offers of housing were made and 80 households have downsized.

Discretionary Housing Payments are also available to those affected who are actively engaged with us.

There is actually much more help available from the Council than I can list here today, and I would urge Members to refer their constituents to our Hubs, where they will be ably supported.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

I'm disappointed with the answer, really, because there was no detail – just reference to a briefing. Maybe the Member just doesn't know?

The reason I asked this in public today is because somebody asked me to and I just expected somebody on top of their brief to come up with a load of facts, but I'm obviously mistaken.

Question: *County Councillor Gordon*

Riverside residents welcome the proposed 20mph speed restriction across the Ward. What measures are there for traffic calming and monitoring the speed of motorists in the scheme?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

We will produce a report on the proposed 20mph scheme in Riverside when the current on-street consultation ends. Detailed design work on the scheme is expected to follow this report and I will continue to ensure that Ward Members are briefed and consulted as we go the way forward on this and I will continue to do that, as I have done over the last few months.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Howells*

Can I ask whether there are any plans for a 20mph zone around Adamsdown Primary School? And I'm thinking, in particular, Constellation Street, now that the school has expanded into two-form entry there is increasing concern about the speed of vehicles on the road. So could you tell me, if there are any plans, when they will be implemented, please?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I think there's a bit of confusion with the zones and with the Safer Routes to Schools, because they are two completely separate issues. And when I say "completely separate issues", the Safer Routes to Schools are going to continue like in the normal way it is, whereas the 20mph limits is what we're looking to expand throughout the city, which is from the city-centre circle. So, from the city-centre circle, we're going outwards and we're making large areas of 20mph zone limits. With the Safer Routes to Schools, it can only be one street or two streets. So that's the big difference.

And with the Safer Routes to Schools, a lot of it has to be traffic-calming measures got to be put in those areas, whereas with the limits, a lot of it is to do with signage, similar to what is happening in Cathays, which is the pilot. So it'd be that.

But there is a rollout programme for the rest of the city as well.

Question: *County Councillor Rea*

If a road is marked for repair by council staff using spray paint, how long after this occurring should the road be repaired?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

Spray paint markings on the city's roads will usually indicate the need for safety-related road repairs or indicate areas that have been identified for specific improvement works.

The timescale for undertaking a safety-related repair, once marked on site, will vary according to the type of defect that is identified. Depending on the severity of the defect, this can range from two hours for defects that are likely to cause imminent harm or damage to 28 days for the repair of routine defects.

There is no specified timescale for the repair of areas of the highway identified for improvement work that is not safety related.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Rea*

I think residents have a reasonable expectation that if a road is marked up and, indeed, when you report a road, you're told that, if it is marked up then it is scheduled for repair. I think residents have a reasonable expectation, once that has happened, that it will happen within a reasonable timescale. And that's for any sort of repair. Whereas, at the moment, there are certain roads in my ward that were marked over four months ago and have still not been repaired, and I think that concerns residents.

If there could be a different way of doing it, that would be useful in order to distinguish those so that residents know when the road will be repaired soon and when it won't be repaired soon.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I know you've just been recently elected but the system is no different than when your administration was in control. It's exactly the same process. There is categories of when it is. But as an elected Member, if you had a concern about a particular road, you could easily bring it to my attention and I could get the Officers to look into that, obviously. But, obviously, we can't do anything if you've got a concern and you don't address it to me directly. So, by all means, send me an email as to where you've got concerns and we'll look into that.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Stubbs*

After a significant amount of lobbying from myself, emails, site visits, Splott's going to see a huge investment in road repair, starting this weekend along Splott Road. But if you could just put on the record that, while Splott Road is being resurfaced, that buses will still continue to go down Splott Road.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

What I can say, the investment has been huge. Yes, absolutely. We've put an extra £320,000 into the repairs of patchwork repairs, which are permanent repairs, not just filling a pothole. And that has been very good feedback from a number of reporters saying that the quality of repair has been very high quality. So that is helpful.

Regarding the buses, I'll have to come back to you on that, but I'm assuming it will be going down there but I will need to check on that.

Question: *County Councillor Graham*

Will the council commit to helping areas of Llanishen and Thornhill where super-fast broadband is not currently available by appealing to the provider to improve the infrastructure?

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Bale*

I am very aware of concerns about the lack of superfast broadband in parts of Llanishen and Thornhill, as it has been raised with me in the past actually, certainly by many of the businesses in the industrial estate.

It is important to note, however, that the Council has no direct responsibility, as you're probably aware, for this matter, but we will continue to work alongside the Welsh Government to press for improvements by service providers to ensure that local residents and businesses get the service that they need and deserve.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Graham*

It was brought to my attention by one of my colleagues that perhaps I'm being slightly selfish and that actually there's probably broadband problems all over the city, so it's an easy supplementary for you to answer but I'm sure that you will, that I'm sure your support extends to the whole city, not just Thornhill and Llanishen.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Bale*

Absolutely. It's an issue that doesn't just affect Cardiff, actually. It's an issue that Welsh Government are looking to address across Wales, remove those hotspots and trying to improve the reliability of the service.

Many cities now in the United States actually market themselves as gigacities. They see the speed of connectivity as being essential to attracting jobs and investment, and that's something that we've got to look at as part of the wider regional city deal discussions.

Question: *County Councillor Gordon*

Is the report available on the 20mph pilot scheme in Cathays?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

A draft report on the 20mph pilot scheme in Cathays has been completed and I have been briefed by officers on the key findings. The lessons learned from the pilot scheme and other cities have informed the future rollout of 20mph limits in the city.

The draft report is currently being reviewed by relevant Officers ahead of its approval by the Director and anticipated publication next month.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Boyle*

If the report does suggest that 20mph zones can have the effects that we hope they have, is there any reason why the proposed rollout that you have announced thus far can't be accelerated and expanded more quickly than appears to be the case? Because it does seem to be quite limited and quite slow and if there is an appetite and the evidence suggests that they work, can we not see them rolled out further and quicker?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I think what's important, there was a clear pilot, which we always from day one have said "we'll have to see some of the results of the pilot." But also, what I did, I also went to other cities so I didn't just rely purely on the pilot. I wanted to see how other cities like London, Edinburgh were doing things as well with the 20mph limits.

All of these things do take a bit of time. This is something absolutely new to us in Cardiff. It is not the Safer Routes to Schools – it is 20mph limits, which are zones. All of this does fiscally cost money, as well, you know? So therefore, there is a clear programme for this, and that is what we're working on is on the programme of the rollout. This is one of the first cities as well. It's actually the only one in Wales, which have been introducing this, and therefore I have pushed this very, very hard from the day I saw the pilot go in when I saw the results were going in and which were looking very positive.

I want to escalate it by looking at other cities quickly to see the results of theirs as well, so I was able to combine the both together.

Question: *County Councillor Sanders*

I understand a consultation on the Wellbeing Assessment, required under the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015, was launched in Cardiff on 12th January 2017. Would the Leader set out in detail how residents across Cardiff can respond to this important consultation? Are all methods for responding available?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

The city's Well-being Assessment was launched by the Cardiff Public Services Board on 12<sup>th</sup> January.

It should be noted, though, that there is no specific statutory requirement to undertake public consultation on the assessment. However, the Public Service Board decided that it was right to do so.

It's primarily an online consultation, but engagement sessions will also continue with the Youth Council, the Older People's Forum, the Access Forum, and with Council Members too, in addition to the 6000 residents on the Citizen Panel, as well, who will have had a copy by email.

If you'd like more details on the consultation, I'm more than happy to provide them to you but the closing date I believe is 26<sup>th</sup> February.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Sanders*

Could you ensure that all groupings across the city are engaged with. Whilst you say there may not be a requirement to engage, it would be foolhardy, I think, not to engage fully. So to make sure that the most appropriate way of that consultation to all groupings across the city is done in a way that is helpful and meaningful to make sure that eventually, when the plan is put in place, it does reflect accurately the needs of what the residents of the city want.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

Absolutely, and as we go through the mapping exercise, looking at needs across the city, it's Members across the chamber that will have a particular knowledge of their communities. And if you've got particular suggestions about groups or organisations, then I'm more than happy to hear from you and to pass them on to colleagues within the Council.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Weaver*

The Wellbeing of Future Generations Act calls upon public bodies to look at making our future sustainable and healthy. And one aspect of that has got to be travel. So I was just asking if you would give an update on the very ambitious cycling strategy that the city has, and the integrated network map for active travel that we have. If we can get people walking and cycling around the city, that will improve the sustainability, the environmental impact, and the health of our citizens.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I firstly pay tribute to the work of Members across the chamber who have done a lot of work in preparing that strategy for consultation. It has received a lot of press attention. Only recently, I was reading a story from people in Cambridge talking about the steps that we were taking. So it's clearly attracted some interest.

In there, there is a range of initiatives, including ring-fenced budgets to maintain cycle routes. We are talking about replacing or putting in place a new cycle-hire scheme. You will remember the previous Liberal Democrat scrapped the Oy Bike scheme just before 2012. We're looking to see if we can put one back into place across the city.

And you're right – we do need to make cycling much more of an attractive, easier option for residents in the city, and that will require not just the Council stepping up but also a wider range of partnerships, and I think certainly the work that you've done and the Cabinet Member as well has been very helpful in that regard, as well as our Cycling Champion, Councillor Gordon.

Question: *County Councillor Clark*

Has the council undertaken an economic impact assessment on the risk of Cardiff being forced out of the Single Market in light of the UK Prime Minister's recent announcement? If so, please give details.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

The Cabinet considered a report on 14th July last year, which explored the implications of the EU Referendum vote on the UK and on Cardiff's economy. And we will continue to keep the position under review as the Brexit negotiations with UK government and Europe continue.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Clark*

I understand that Labour MPs in Cardiff are divided in their approach to our departure from the European Union. Do you agree with Jo Stevens or Stephen Doughty on the best approach for the next steps on the European Union?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

Well, certainly we haven't got any Liberal MPs to be concerned about in terms of any disagreement in the city. I'm not aware of any issues with the current Members of Parliament in Cardiff. If I do see them, I'll make sure that I ask them.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Huw Thomas*

In a sense, the position of Cardiff MPs matters not from your perspective, Councillor Bale because Cardiff as a local authority voted to remain, and so the mandate for us as a city council is clear: to represent the views of our citizens, respecting the wider result of course, but lobbying and asking for the softest possible Brexit possible, and avoiding the frankly disastrous proposals being put forward by the Conservative government.

My question is: what representations are you making in your capacity as Leader of the City Council to officials and ministers in UK government to represent of access to the single market to Cardiff?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

Absolutely. As you know, 60/40 split in terms of that referendum. It was a rather unique situation in terms of Wales. I sit on the First Minister's EU advisory group, so I'm plugged in in terms of advising Welsh Government. And that is because I'm also

the WLGA spokesperson for Europe as well, and I'll be going to Brussels in March as part of that role.

It's incredibly important that we get greater clarity from the UK government in terms of what it will be doing. I understand that they are, under pressure, publishing a white paper that will explore some of their thinking. As soon as we get a clearer picture, we'll continue to make sure that we put forward views of local government across Wales and Cardiff in particular.

Question: *County Councillor Hudson*

How much money has been paid out in compensation to motorists claiming over the poor state of the roads in 2015 & 2016?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

Compensation paid out to motorists due to carriageway defects in 2016 calendar year was £7550.92, which was half that paid out in 2015, which was £14,063.78.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Hudson*

Will the Council utilise the millions of pounds collected through speeding fines, bus-lane fines, and other traffic violations to improve our roads to a decent standard? Although this administration may not be responsible after the next local elections - if they're not elected or they choose not to stand, this question may be largely academic. And in the interest of brevity, I'm willing to accept the reply in writing.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

No, I'm happy to answer the question actually now, rather than putting it in writing.

I think it's quite important to point out, as I said earlier on, £320,00 extra was for actual repairs. And we've done far more repairs over the same period than the previous administration when it came to permanent repairs. When I say permanent repairs - resurfacing of roads.

But I think what is important is this: as I said, 2016, the claims £7550.92. In 2011, in the final years of the Lib Dem and Plaid administration, the number of claims: £793,743.64. Compare that with £7550.92.

Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

How much did the Council spend on newspapers in 2015-2016 (please differentiate the amount spent by libraries in the sum total)?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

The relevant budget code used for Council does not distinguish between newspapers and periodicals but I'll give the overall figure anyway.



In 2015/16, our records show that expenditure on newspapers and professional periodicals was £34,000, or just over.

This includes, as Councillor McEvoy asked for details, in libraries. Two thirds of that amount went into libraries that obviously was purchased primarily for public consumption and library users.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

So a third of £24,000, roughly just over £11,000 would probably account for newspapers in County Hall. We all see them every day going to many departments. That's an easy cut, isn't it? Do you agree?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

I can be more specific for you, Neil - £8,879 of that money you automatically put against the Council is for schools. And that was to support sixth formers and their libraries.

Question: *County Councillor Howells*

Did Cardiff Council submit an application for the 2017 Stonewall Workplace Equality Index?

Reply: *County Councillor De'Ath*

I am really pleased to confirm that officers are currently working on a submission to the 2018 Equality Index, to be summited in a few months' time.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Howells*

Well, it'd be churlish of me not to welcome that news, but it has taken you an awful long time to accept that, if we are to really recognise that equality of our staff in the workplace is an important aspect and we do need to have a benchmark with which we need to measure ourselves with.

So whilst I welcome what you're saying that we are going to be submitting one for next year, we would have been doing that anyway under a Liberal Democrat administration.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Stubbs*

February marks LGBT History Month. This year is a particularly important year because it's 50 years since the first step was made on the road to equality. I just wondered what the Council are doing to mark this particularly important year.

Reply: *County Councillor De'Ath*

Myself and the Leader have met recently with our LGBT staff network. The Leader has met with Stonewall Cymru and he's offered to host their LGBT BME roll-model

scheme, which launches in March at County Hall with our staff network to really celebrate this important agenda. So not just the Leader and myself, but the whole administration.

Question: *County Councillor Robson*

What has been the cost to the Council, year by year, since 2012 for removing unauthorised encampments in Cardiff's parks and open spaces and the cost of making good any damage which may have been caused?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I can confirm that the estimated total costs of removing unauthorised encampments on land vested with the Parks Service for the period since 2012 is £1235.50.

And breakdown on a year-by-year, it was nil in 2012, nil in 2013, £291 in 2014, £339.50 – don't forget the 50 pence – in 2015, and £605 in 2016.

In terms of making good the land, the total estimated costs for the period are £128, which was incurred last year.

There were nil costs for those other periods for making good the land.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Robson*

Can you supply that to me in writing and can you, please, also include the cost of preventative measures in our parks and open spaces to prevent reoccurrences of unauthorised encampments.

Question: *County Councillor Hunt*

Can you comment on the contact there has been with the police in respect of parking problems at Tatham Road in Llanishen?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I have not been made aware of any contact between the Council and Police in respect of parking problems in Tatham Road in Llanishen.

However, I would be more than happy to meet with you on site to gain a better understanding of the concerns that local residents, as well as you and other ward Members, may have about current parking problems in the area.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Hunt*

The difficulty, I think, that's arisen in this area, I'm told, is due to parking, I think, by staff who work in the local HMRC office. I just wondered if, when a solution is sought for the particular problem, if it could be taken into account that people are working in that particular office and if their staff or the management there could be consulted in anything that moves ahead.

Reply: County Councillor Patel

Absolutely. I think what would be helpful, maybe if you were able to just drop me an email and maybe, when you're next in County Hall, we can meet up and try and see if there's a way forward on this and try to see if there's ways of trying to find some sort of solution for this.

133 : URGENT BUSINESS

134 : APPOINTMENT OF LOCAL AUTHORITY SCHOOL GOVERNORS

The Council received the recommendations on appointments to Local authority School Governors from the Local authority Governor Panel of 12 January 2017.

RESOLVED – That the recommendations be approved as follows: -

1. appointments to existing Local Authority Governor Vacancies: -

School	Ward	Start of Vacancy	Appointment
Bryn Hafod Primary School	Llanrumney	19/05/2016	Rachel Johnson
Fitzalan High School	Canton	19/12/2016	Daniel Morgan
Moorland Primary School	Splott	26/09/2016	Councillor Ed Stubbs
Radyr Primary School	Radyr	22/11/2016	Jane Griffiths
Rhydypenau Primary School	Cyncoed	01/10/2016	Sian Evans
Woodlands High School	Caerau	10/12/2015	Doug Corp
Ysgol Gyfun Gymraeg Glantaf	Llandaff North	26/10/2016	Nia Blackwell

2. appointments to future Local authority Governor vacancies to 31 March 2017: -

School	Ward	Start of Vacancy	Appointment
Rhiwbeina Primary School	Rhiwbina	29/03/2017	Siva Sivapalan
Rhydypenau Primary School	Cyncoed	25/02/2017	Anne Gee
Springwood Primary School	Pentwyn	25/02/2107	Councillor Boyle
St Francis RC Primary School	Ely	5/02/2017	Councillor Goddard
St Mellons CiW Primary School	Llanrumney	25/02/2017	Councillor Dianne Rees
Ysgol Pwll Coch	Canton	27/02/2017	William Callaway

135 : POLITICAL BALANCE AND COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

The Council received an updated on the change in political balance since the last meeting and the nominations from Party Groups to existing committee vacancies and Chair of Democratic Services Committee and Deputy Chair of Planning Committee.

RESOLVED – That

1. the change in political composition of the Council was noted
2. the nominations to committee vacancies and Chair and Deputy Chair of Committees were approved as follows: -

<b>Committee</b>	<b>Nomination</b>
Constitution Committee	Councillor Ed Bridges ( <i>to replace former Councillor Margaret Jones</i> )
Democratic Services Committee	Councillor Joe Boyle ( <i>to replace Councillor Clark</i> )
Environment Scrutiny Committee	Councillor Tariq Awan ( <i>current Plaid vacancy</i> ) Councillor Keith Jones ( <i>to replace former Councillor Lomax</i> )
Works Council	Councillor Judith Woodman ( <i>to replace former Councillor Margaret Jones</i> )
Pension Committee	Councillor Woodman ( <i>to replace former Councillor Margaret Jones</i> )
Chair of Democratic Services Committee	Councillor Joe Boyle ( <i>to replace Councillor Clark</i> )
Deputy Chairperson Planning Committee	Councillor Lynda Thorne ( <i>to replace Councillor Manzoor Ahmed</i> )

136 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

The following Written Question and Answers have been process in accordance with the Council Procedure Rules 17 (f).

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, CO-OPERATIVES AND SOCIAL ENTERPRISE  
(COUNCILLOR PETER BRADBURY)  
WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOYLE

Which leisure centres were closed in the week between Christmas and the 3<sup>rd</sup> January and on what days?

Does this represent a change in practice from previous years?

Reply

All leisure centres were closed from 24<sup>th</sup> to 27<sup>th</sup> December 2016, with the exception of Western Leisure Centre, which remained open on 24<sup>th</sup> December 2016 from 9:00am until 4:00pm only.

Maindy Centre remained closed between 24<sup>th</sup> December 2016 and 2<sup>nd</sup> January 2017, re-opening on 3<sup>rd</sup> January 2017.

All leisure centres were closed on 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> January 2017.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

Why did Pentwyn leisure centre not receive any food deliveries for several weeks to the cafeteria from 1st December when the new contract took over?

Had the council not ensured any transition arrangements in this regard?

Reply

The delay in fresh food deliveries was due to an error linked to ordering systems introduced by the incoming service provider, GLL. Normal service resumed within two days.

The Council had facilitated a prior agreement between GLL and the supplier for continuity of service in advance of transfer. The situation has been rectified and we are assured that it will not occur again.

The closures, as set out above, are consistent with closures when compared with previous years.

CORPORATE SERVICES AND PERFORMANCE  
(COUNCILLOR GRAHAM HINCHEY)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

Please provide costs for outsourcing legal work for the following service areas for the period 01/04/16 to 01/01/17:

- Education;
- Parks; and
- Highways & transport?

Reply

Please find below details of expenditure for 2016/17 (up to 1 January 2017):

## Education

	<b>Education</b>	<b>Delegated Schools</b>	<b>Total Education</b>
	£	£	£
General Legal Expenses	250	16,195	16,445
Legal Disbursements	8,305	0	8,305
Compromise Agreements	3,791	225	4,016
Third Party Legal Fees	4,231	0	4,231
<b>Total Spend</b>	<b>16,577</b>	<b>16,420</b>	<b>32,997</b>

## Parks

- £2,765 for general legal expenses relating to a land swap at Lascelles Drive in Pontprennau.

## Transport

- £8,468.50 for payment to external solicitors for work on the legal contract relating to on-street cycle hire.
- £1,200 for external legal advice and professional fees relating to an employment tribunal settlement.

## WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

Has a risk assessment been carried out in regard to the car park attendants at County Hall during the recent cold weather, and what measures have been put in place to ensure they are kept as warm as possible?

## Reply

Yes, a risk assessment has been undertaken previously and this was reviewed in autumn 2016.

Advice was sought from the Council's Health and Safety team and the control measures which have been put in place include:

- Provision of appropriate Personal Protective Equipment (PPE) equivalent to that provided to the Council's Waste Collection Teams who work outdoors continuously for long periods of time. The PPE includes wet weather protective clothing, fleece, thermal hat/scarf/gloves/socks and appropriate footwear;
- Provision of a two-way short wave radio to each attendant to provide constant access to managers for advice and support on car parking, inclement weather issues, etc.;
- Provision of a cabin to provide shelter;
- A break of 1 hour duration at the middle of the attendants' shift period;

- Access to appropriate facilities to make hot drinks, and
- Rotating the required patrols of the car park between the attendants to assist with the generation of internal body heat through movement.

Unfortunately, there is no suitable power supply available for the attendants' cabin in the car park at the current time. However, if and when a suitable power supply is supplied to the car park area, an electric heater will also be provided within the cabin.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR KELLOWAY

What was the total amount spent on external consultants by the Council in each of 2012/13, 2013/14, 2014/15, 2015/16?

Please could the name of the consultant, the date(s) the service was provided and the amount given to each consultant in each year be provided?

Reply

<b>Consultant</b>	<b>2012-13</b>	<b>2013-14</b>	<b>2014-15</b>	<b>2015-16</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>
	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>
3D MODEL MAINTENANCE			1,800		<b>1,800</b>
ADAM MORTON				375	<b>375</b>
AECOM		10,670	4,638	39,144	<b>54,452</b>
ALETHO CONSULTING LTD				675	<b>675</b>
Andrew Cozens WLGA				17,476	<b>17,476</b>
ANDY GALE HOUSING CONSULT		500			<b>500</b>
APSE		17,554			<b>17,554</b>
ARCADIS LLP		2,521	20,179	1	<b>22,701</b>
Archaeology Wales Ltd	5,030	43,485			<b>48,515</b>
ASCL Professional Development Ltd		3,845	769		<b>4,614</b>
Ash Wales (Cardiff)		1,500			<b>1,500</b>
Atkins Consultants Ltd	44,411	36,276	14,563	15,881	<b>111,131</b>
ATQ CONSULTANTS LLP		42,445			<b>42,445</b>
B.D.O.LLP	80,971				<b>80,971</b>
BASIS TRAINING (UK) LTD			830	990	<b>1,820</b>
BDO LLP		57,860	52,750		<b>110,610</b>
Ben Sutcliffe Marine Surveys	611				<b>611</b>
Bilfinger GVA				1,575	<b>1,575</b>
BMG Research			29,725		<b>29,725</b>
Brighter Comms			6,595		<b>6,595</b>
BSI STANDARDS & TESTING			64		<b>64</b>
Building Research Establishment		16,500	9,000	9,200	<b>34,700</b>
CAMARGUE GROUP LTD				1,000	<b>1,000</b>
Capita Symonds Ltd	61,841	861			<b>62,702</b>
Carbon Trust	1,500				<b>1,500</b>

<b>Consultant</b>	<b>2012-13</b>	<b>2013-14</b>	<b>2014-15</b>	<b>2015-16</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>
	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>
Cardiff Tourist Building Feasibility			15,420		<b>15,420</b>
Cardiff University	8,419				<b>8,419</b>
CIVITAS Law			5,000		<b>5,000</b>
Colliers	6,500				<b>6,500</b>
CONSTRUCTING EXCELLENCE IN WALES			20,000		<b>20,000</b>
Curve Consulting			500	375	<b>875</b>
DAVID CLEMENTS ECOLOGY LTD		1,620			<b>1,620</b>
DAVIES SUTTON (CARDIFF)		715	3,500		<b>4,215</b>
Davies Sutton Architects	1,400				<b>1,400</b>
Deloitte LLP			57,580		<b>57,580</b>
DragonGate Market Intelligence Ltd		953			<b>953</b>
DTZ	11,862	7,138			<b>19,001</b>
EA Pwll Mawr		544			<b>544</b>
EARTH SCIENCE PARTNERSHIP		3,480			<b>3,480</b>
Eco Designs				1,615	<b>1,615</b>
Effective Communications				25,845	<b>25,845</b>
Einfinity		6,045			<b>6,045</b>
Energise Ltd			6,965		<b>6,965</b>
Energy Saving Trust		5,471	15,673	-15,439	<b>5,705</b>
ESCAPE TO DESIGN LTD			730	23,602	<b>24,332</b>
EXACTRAK		1,584			<b>1,584</b>
EXP Consulting (Nottingham)		11,980			<b>11,980</b>
FACILITATING THE FUTURE			28,125		<b>28,125</b>
FAITHFUL AND GOULD	13,709	27,492	14,489	4,171	<b>59,861</b>
Fernleigh Design	6,880	5,000			<b>11,880</b>
FRONTLINE EPC'S LLP		900			<b>900</b>
G V A GRIMLEY LTD		149,106	204,216	77,945	<b>431,268</b>
Gareth Kiddie Associates				429	<b>429</b>
Gatenby Sanderson Ltd	109,127	96,195	7,823		<b>213,145</b>
Good Relations Wales		600			<b>600</b>
Grant Thornton	122,735	85,105	118,763	79,845	<b>406,448</b>
Greengauge 21	22,500				<b>22,500</b>
Hay Group	13,683				<b>13,683</b>
HELEN MOSELEY-WILLIAMS		2,171			<b>2,171</b>
History Points		150			<b>150</b>
Holder Mathias Architects		4,975			<b>4,975</b>
I.E.S.E LTD			28,325		<b>28,325</b>
Ian Palfreyman Consulting	12,000				<b>12,000</b>
IMC Management Consultants Ltd		2,044			<b>2,044</b>
In Partnership With Ltd				24,000	<b>24,000</b>



<b>Consultant</b>	<b>2012-13</b>	<b>2013-14</b>	<b>2014-15</b>	<b>2015-16</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>
	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>
Inservia Ltd	3,696				<b>3,696</b>
Insight Human Resources	73,248				<b>73,248</b>
Ivy Ltd			24,962		<b>24,962</b>
J Bresner		36,380			<b>36,380</b>
JACOBS LTD			19,254	10,775	<b>30,029</b>
Jan Horwath				1,087	<b>1,087</b>
Jane Moore Associates Ltd			25,446		<b>25,446</b>
JLW Consultancy	1,837				<b>1,837</b>
John Ritchie Consultant				20,000	<b>20,000</b>
JONES LANG LASALLE		8,850			<b>8,850</b>
K.P.M.G				176,442	<b>176,442</b>
K2 PROJECTS LTD		6,440			<b>6,440</b>
LAMBERT SMITH HAMPTON		177			<b>177</b>
Lloyd George Avenue CGI			1,014		<b>1,014</b>
Local Partnerships LLP			39,253		<b>39,253</b>
Marsh Ltd	6,256	14,308	11,069	1,609	<b>33,242</b>
Martin Price Associates	4,500				<b>4,500</b>
Maunder and Ward HR Specialists Ltd		17,500		26,150	<b>43,650</b>
MAX Associates			19,500		<b>19,500</b>
Mega International Ltd	1,225				<b>1,225</b>
Mel Usher Associates	1,624				<b>1,624</b>
Mel Witherton				900	<b>900</b>
METHODS CONSULTING LTD	410,919	38,349			<b>449,268</b>
Metrodynamics				60,819	<b>60,819</b>
Morgan Cole Solicitors		31,018	12,447	176	<b>43,642</b>
MOTT MACDONALD LTD	80,710	76,840	61,555	51,050	<b>270,155</b>
MSS Consulting Ltd (Cardiff)		2,148			<b>2,148</b>
MSS ENVIRONMENTAL LTD		518	518		<b>1,036</b>
Music Education Solutions Ltd				390	<b>390</b>
NAS/Adoption Register miscodes RCT				2,395	<b>2,395</b>
Nepro Ltd			74,360	113,467	<b>187,827</b>
Nib Consultancy Ltd	700				<b>700</b>
Northgate Information Solutions	5,592				<b>5,592</b>
NORTHGATE PUBLIC SERVICES		1,000			<b>1,000</b>
Oco Global Ltd			13,500		<b>13,500</b>
Okotech Ltd			24,992		<b>24,992</b>
OLM Systems Ltd				515	<b>515</b>
Oracle Corporation	3,729				<b>3,729</b>
OVE ARUP AND PARTNERS	48,238	8,983	4	1,894	<b>59,119</b>
Oxford Brookes University	10,282				<b>10,282</b>
PARRY AND DAWKIN (SWANSEA			1,500		<b>1,500</b>

<b>Consultant</b>	<b>2012-13</b>	<b>2013-14</b>	<b>2014-15</b>	<b>2015-16</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>
	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>
Parsons Brinckerhoff Ltd	76,028	27,183	196		<b>103,407</b>
PAUL BEVAN AND ASSOCIATES LTD		1,725			<b>1,725</b>
PAUL HOPEWELL				825	<b>825</b>
Penna PLC	1,875				<b>1,875</b>
PEOPLETOO LTD			75,250	64,700	<b>139,950</b>
Personal Care Consultants Ltd	189		169		<b>358</b>
Pinsent Masons	161,650	138,783	73,042		<b>373,475</b>
PML (Programme Management) Ltd			8,144		<b>8,144</b>
PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP	25,000		974		<b>25,974</b>
PROF. CHRIS J ADAMS				225	<b>225</b>
Progressive Procurement Ltd	15,000				<b>15,000</b>
Q-Bot Limited			11,654		<b>11,654</b>
R Fotheringham	27,054				<b>27,054</b>
Ray Sanderson			500		<b>500</b>
RHONWYN DOBBING				6,844	<b>6,844</b>
RNIB Cymru		280			<b>280</b>
Rob Jennings			500		<b>500</b>
ROCKALL SAFETY LTD			68		<b>68</b>
ROGER NORTH LONG AND PARTNERS				750	<b>750</b>
Russam GMS Ltd	6,563				<b>6,563</b>
RVW Consulting	49,612	3,100			<b>52,712</b>
S&C Procurement		3,088			<b>3,088</b>
SANTIA CONSULTING LTD				939	<b>939</b>
Saunders Lambert (Cardiff)			2,264	2,289	<b>4,553</b>
Savills	10,000				<b>10,000</b>
Servoca Resource Solutions Ltd			1,344		<b>1,344</b>
Sharp Edge UK Ltd	8,052				<b>8,052</b>
Simon Inkson Ltd	1,841				<b>1,841</b>
Slate Education				2,640	<b>2,640</b>
STEVENS & ASSOCIATES/ANIAN LEISURE			2,125		<b>2,125</b>
Stillwater Associates Ltd	2,535				<b>2,535</b>
STRAINSTALL UK LTD			1,020	144	<b>1,164</b>
Straker RP Solutions		9,680			<b>9,680</b>
STRICTLY EDUCATION LTD		1,181	1,583		<b>2,764</b>
STRIDE TREGLOWN LTD			15,147		<b>15,147</b>
Sturgess Ecology	105				<b>105</b>
Sturgis Carbon Profiling LLP			16,025		<b>16,025</b>
SUSTRANS				30,000	<b>30,000</b>
Systemlink 2000	13,740				<b>13,740</b>

Consultant	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	Grand Total
	£	£	£	£	£
TERRA FIRMA (WALES) LTD				2,100	<b>2,100</b>
The British Computer Society	1,284				<b>1,284</b>
The Energy Saving Trust		53,708	9,757	17,700	<b>81,166</b>
THE HAY GROUP MANAGEMENT LTD		65,393	4,400	8,950	<b>78,743</b>
The Haywood Hain LLP		2,239			<b>2,239</b>
The Means		4,096			<b>4,096</b>
The Messaging Centre Ltd			362		<b>362</b>
THE URBANISTS LTD				10,000	<b>10,000</b>
Timothy James Consulting	26,875				<b>26,875</b>
TSO Ventures Ltd		9,600			<b>9,600</b>
TURFTRAX GROUND MANAGEMEN				5,755	<b>5,755</b>
Unicus Cofac		3,900			<b>3,900</b>
UNITED KINGDOM ACCREDITAT			4,124		<b>4,124</b>
UNTETHERED LTD			500		<b>500</b>
Veredus	31,060				<b>31,060</b>
Vision Thing Communications	2,100				<b>2,100</b>
VIVUS LIME LTD			24,930		<b>24,930</b>
Waterman Civils Ltd		1,600			<b>1,600</b>
WAVEHILL LTD				27,850	<b>27,850</b>
Westgate PR Agency		9,000			<b>9,000</b>
WILKIN CHAPMAN LLP			4,000		<b>4,000</b>
XEIAD LTD		35,149			<b>35,149</b>
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>1,636,300</b>	<b>1,259,498</b>	<b>1,255,475</b>	<b>958,086</b>	<b>5,109,359</b>

EDUCATION (COUNCILLOR SARAH MERRY)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CARTER

Has the council changed the providers for school dinners in 2017?

Why are children being given paper plates rather than plastic trays?

Reply

The Council's School Catering Team continues to provide the school meal provision in the majority of Cardiff Schools. The only exceptions are:

- Cardiff High School;
- Bishop of Llandaff CW High School; and
- Willows High School.

Each of these schools operates their own internal catering function.

Paper plates are only used in an emergency situation when a school kitchen's dishwasher is not working or if there has been a loss of hot water. They are used as the safe alternative for food safety reasons.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CARTER

How many children were unable to get into their first preference high school in September 2016 and how did this compare to 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014 and 2015?

Reply

The percentage of applications that were unsuccessful in getting their first preference community high school was as follows:

<b>Year</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
2016	10.7%
2015	7.7%
2014	19%
2013	19%
2012	Data not available
2011	Data not available

ENVIRONMENT (COUNCILLOR BOB DERBYSHIRE)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

In November 2015, I asked you whether Cardiff might emulate the policy of Daventry District Council who introduced a byelaw whereby dog owners must prove how they would clear up mess left by their pet. Those not carrying a 'poop bag' with them liable to a £100 fine. Will you reconsider whether such a measure could be adopted by Cardiff?

Reply

Consideration of measures that will improve our city's environment is continually happening. However, following a review of this specific measure, a number of concerns have been highlighted which means – at this time – that it would not make a noticeable improvement and may create concerns about how we utilise our enforcement powers.

For example, many responsible dog owners may only carry one dog waste bag whilst walking their dog and, once the fouling has taken place, they dispose of the waste responsibly, but no longer have a bag in their possession. It would therefore seem unfair and not in the public interest to issue a fine to the dog owner in such circumstances.

Nevertheless, the Council's Urban Park Rangers and Waste Education and Enforcement Officers are already working actively to issue fixed penalty notices to those owners who fail to clean up after their dogs as part of our zero tolerance campaign.

In addition, recent media reports have highlighted concerns raised by the Dogs Trust about whether the policy is effective or practical, as well as the fact that not a single fine has been issued following the introduction of these enforcement powers by Daventry District Council back in December 2015.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CHAUNDY

How many council managed public toilets were in Cardiff in 2007 and how many today in 2017?

Reply

There were 31 council managed public toilets in Cardiff in 2007 and there are 16 today in 2017.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CHAUNDY

Other than the Hayes toilet with controlled access, many other public toilet facilities already exist but are sealed or locked up. Have all avenues to re-open and alternatively manage these premises been explored, privately or otherwise?

Reply

At present, the Council does not intend to reopen or alternatively manage these premises. However, officers are exploring opportunities for partnership working through the development of a Public Conveniences Strategy. Partnerships are being developed with a range of public service providers, businesses and community organisations (e.g. local, retailers, church halls etc.) and the work is focused predominantly on providing signposting information to the public about the availability of public conveniences in the city. This includes making information more readily available, such as the locations of public conveniences (e.g. the address and GPS point), opening times and facilities therein (e.g. accessibility/RADAR key, baby changing facilities). We expect to make this information available later this year and for this to be publicised via the Council's website, community partnerships, local media and existing mobile phone apps.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR REA

What is the breakdown for the past eight years, by year, of:

- a. The cost of collecting bulky waste items;
- b. Income generated by charges for collecting bulky waste items;
- c. The cost of administrating bulky waste collection charges?

Please can you also provide any projections of the above under the new system of charging for some items but not others, and any income projections for the reuse centre?

Reply

A detailed breakdown of bulky collection service costs is provided below:

<b>Year</b>	<b>Admin. Costs</b>	<b>Cost of Collection</b>	<b>Income from Charging for Collection</b>	<b>Total</b>
2008/09	39,034	257,619	-2,911	293,743
2009/10	40,342	331,915	-4,102	368,155
2010/11	134,626	458,869	-2,347	591,148
2011/12	83,257	286,955	-2,207	368,004
2012/13	11,545	245,533	-2,002	255,076
2013/14	85,483	208,574	-59,943	234,114
2014/15	79,616	264,649	-86,919	257,346
2015/16	13,861	229,685	-154,540	89,006
<b>Total</b>	<b>487,764</b>	<b>2,283,798</b>	<b>-314,970</b>	<b>2,456,592</b>

*These costs do not include disposal costs, which have reduced by ~£100,000*

The cost profile for 2016/17 is expected to remain static this year as the service only started in December 2016. Going forward, the free collection service will be afforded by delivering the service in a different way, using different vehicles, with less disposal required and it is cheaper to recycle, thereby leading to reduced collection and disposal costs.

Therefore, the budgets will remain static, whilst the customer benefits from free collections and we support increased recycling. You will note, however, that the Council still supports the costs of the service for customers by £89,006.

It is too early to provide a cost profile for the reuse centre as the business model is still under development with partners.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CARTER

How many people have been charged for a new bin since the charge was introduced and how much income has been generated?

Reply

Of the 153,000 households in Cardiff, 1,178 homes have been charged for a new bin since the charge was introduced during this financial year. In addition, we have also provided 8,054 households with a free replacement bin under the same policy. This has provided £29,450 in income to offset the costs of operating the services.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CARTER

How many times were the probation team used to remove litter or rubbish in Pentwyn and Llanedeyrn in 2015/16?

Reply

The Probation Service was utilised on a twice monthly basis throughout the 2015/16 financial year, which was a total of 24 work days.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR KELLOWAY

What was the total tonnage of contaminated waste that had been presented for recycling in each of the following years: 2012/13, 2013/14, 2014/15, 2015/16?

Reply

The annual tonnages of non-recyclable materials from green bags that were received by Cardiff's Material Reclamation Facility (MRF) were as follows:

2012/13 = 4048 tonnes from a total of 33782 tonnes received (12%)

2013/14 = 6407 tonnes from a total of 33593 tonnes received (19%)

2014/15 = 3987 tonnes from a total of 32425 tonnes received (12%)

2015/16 = 5553 tonnes from a total of 34129 tonnes received (16%)

Our MRF remains within industry norms, which can vary between 12% and 20%. It should be noted that, since 2015, the global markets have increased the quality standard of what they will accept, so we have to provide cleaner materials in order to obtain the higher recycling income rates.

HEALTH, HOUSING AND WELLBEING (COUNCILLOR SUSAN ELSMORE)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CHAUNDY

When a council tenant is advised of eviction, are any 'additional resources' provided for any children involved to ensure their wellbeing, education and health and any support to reduce or prevent emotional trauma caused as a result?

Reply

Evictions from council properties only take place as a last resort for very serious rent arrears or anti-social behaviour issues.

A rent arrears prevention strategy was put in place several years ago and, as a result, evictions for arrears (the main cause of eviction) have fallen from 105 in 2008/09 to 58 in 2015/16 – a reduction of 45%. This reduction has been achieved despite the considerable extra pressures of welfare reform.

Housing officers make contact with tenants as soon as they fall into arrears and all possible methods are used to make contact including home visits, telephone, text and letters. Affordable agreements are made to repay the arrears. There is also a dedicated Welfare Liaison Team and officers will visit tenants in their own homes to

assist with income maximisation and budgeting. Help will be given to claim any benefit or grants that the tenant may be entitled to.

At each stage of the arrears process, officers try to assist and support the tenant. Referrals are also made to other agencies such as Tenant Support or Children Services, when appropriate.

If this intervention and support is unsuccessful at bringing the arrears under control, the tenant is invited to attend a Rent Review Panel meeting. Again, all efforts to assist the tenant will be made and a further agreement to pay arrears at an affordable amount is normally made. Only if this agreement is broken will an application to Court be considered.

If a case does proceed to Court, a further agreement to pay will always be considered, although the outcome of the Court hearing is ultimately the decision of the Judge.

Prior to any warrant of eviction being requested, the officers would carry out visits, make telephone contact and send further letters giving the tenant every opportunity to engage even at that late stage. If the tenant does engage and shows a commitment to a payment plan, it may be possible to defer the eviction.

Every effort is made to help tenants to meet their rent payments and it is essential that the rental income is received as the Council is not allowed by law to subsidise the Housing Revenue Account.

The Homelessness Section is informed of any potential evictions and officers try to engage with the tenant and work with them to prevent the eviction. If the eviction goes ahead, temporary accommodation will often be provided while their case is considered.

Officers will also inform Children Services, of any potential evictions where children are affected. When Children Services receive a contact informing that a family are facing eviction and there are children to consider, every effort would be made to speak to the parents or carers and to advise them to seek extra support from agencies such as Shelter, Citizens Advice Bureau etc. and/or explore the private rented sector for alternative accommodation in the hope that they would be able to resolve the issue to prevent the necessity for the involvement of statutory services.

However, should the family not be able to find their own solution and become homeless (or be likely to become homeless), Children Services would have a duty to complete a well-being assessment under the Social Services & Wellbeing (Wales) Act as the children would be deemed to have care and support needs. The service would only have a responsibility to the children in this situation, rather than the family as a whole. Children Services would, however, endeavour to keep the family together and would support them in hostel or other temporary accommodation, rather than accommodate the children separately, wherever possible, whilst working with the family to address their issues.



WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CARTER

How many people replied to the Right to Buy consultation?

Reply

Following approval by Cabinet in November 2016, public consultation on the proposal to apply for a suspension of the Right to Buy / Right to Acquire took place between 28 November 2017 and 31 December 2016.

A personal letter, information sheet and survey form together with a stamped addressed envelope was sent to all council and housing association tenants and to all applicants on the Common Housing Waiting List.

A presentation was made at the 'Tenants Voice' Meeting to raise awareness amongst council tenants and encourage participation in the survey. The survey was also advertised through the Hubs and the Council and Cardiff Tenants websites and Local Housing Associations were encouraged to also advertise on their websites.

Level of Response

2,785 individual responses to the consultation were received, which is a very pleasing level of response.

There was a good level of response from social tenants with 1,330 (48%) responses from council tenants and 951 (34%) from housing association tenants. Those on the housing waiting list were also well represented with 586 (21%) responses.

178 (6%) responses were neither from someone who was neither a social tenant nor on the waiting list for housing, showing participation from the wider community.

Responses were received from a wide range of individuals: 1,120 (40.21%) identified themselves as having a disability and 428 (15%) as being from an ethnic minority background.

Results of the Consultation

57.2% of respondents agreed with the proposal to suspend the Right to Buy / Acquire, 30.4% disagreed and 12.5% were unsure. This is a pleasing level of agreement with the proposal.

The Cabinet is expected to consider this matter further in February 2017 and will take full account of the consultation response.

LEADER – ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PARTNERSHIPS  
(COUNCILLOR PHIL BALE)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR GOVIER

How many elected members in total make up the 10 local authorities participating in the City Deal?

Reply

536 (subject to any seats that are currently vacant).

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR GOVIER

How many Cardiff councillors submitted a response to the call for evidence from the Cardiff Capital Region's Growth Commission?

Reply

This information is held by the independent Cardiff Capital Region Growth and Competitiveness Commission. Permission will be sought from the Commission to release any information. If this information is provided, I will ensure that it is made available to you in due course.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR GOVIER

How many Cardiff councillors were invited to an interview by the Cardiff Capital Region's Growth Commission?

Reply

This information is held by the independent Cardiff Capital Region Growth and Competitiveness Commission. Permission will be sought from the Commission to release any information. If this information is provided, I will ensure that it is made available to you in due course. However, as far as I'm aware, I was the only Cardiff councillor – as Leader of the City Council – to be invited to interview by the Commission.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR GOVIER

Please provide the total number of councillors across all 10 local authorities involved in the City Deal who submitted a response to the call for evidence from the Cardiff Capital Region's Growth Commission?

Reply

This information is held by the independent Cardiff Capital Region Growth and Competitiveness Commission. Permission will be sought from the Commission to release any information. If this information is provided, I will ensure that it is made available to you in due course.

SKILLS, SAFETY AND ENGAGEMENT (COUNCILLOR DAN DE'ATH)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CLARK

With regard to the mandatory and additional licensing schemes in Cathays:

- How many properties did the Council identify that met the mandatory and additional licensing criteria at 30 June 2015? For how many of these properties were licenses applied for between 1 July 2010 to 30 June 2015 and how many properties met the required standards by 30 June 2015?
- What is the number of landlords (with an indication of how many properties they owned in Cathays between them) who have been fined for not applying for a license and what was the individual sum of each fine between 1 July 2010 to 30 June 2015 and from 1 July 2015 to date?
- What is the number of landlords who applied for a licence between 1 July 2010 to 30 June 2015 who were fined for not bringing their properties up to the required standard by 30 June 2015 and the individual sum of each fine?
- How are landlords monitored on whether they tell their tenants about the correct waste presentation arrangements and how many of these landlords have been fined for not telling their tenants about the correct waste presentation arrangements?
- What is the number of properties which did not meet the required standard by 30 June 2015 broken down by main problem area? For example, lack of smoke alarm, insulation etc.
- I understand tenants can have some/all of their rent reimbursed if the licensing requirements are not met. If so, how many tenants in Cathays have had their rent reimbursed between 1 July 2010 to date?

Reply

A full evaluation of the Cathays Additional Licensing Scheme 2010-2015 is available on the HMO licensing page of the Council's website. In response to your questions in relation to the original Cathays scheme:

1. 1664 HMOs were licensed under the Additional Licensing Scheme, in addition to 510 larger HMOs licensed under mandatory licensing provisions, giving a total of 2,174 licensed HMOs in the area. On expiry of the 2010-2015 Scheme, 63% of HMOs met prescribed standards.
2. During the course of the scheme, there were 5 separate convictions for failure to licence 5 HMOs with fines totalling £6,555 (£255; £400; £1500; £400 and £4,000 respectively). There was one conviction for exceeding the permitted number of occupiers (fine = £300) and one contravention of the Prevention of Damage by Pests Act (fine = £2,000).

3. There were no convictions for breaching licence conditions.
4. All licence holders are required to inform their tenants of the correct waste presentation and disposal arrangements, which are laid out in the licence conditions and to obtain a signed declaration from tenants that they will abide by those arrangements. Regrettably, it is beyond the scope of the current scheme to monitor compliance with this requirement.
5. On expiry of the 2010-2015 Scheme, 37% of licensed HMOs were still to be improved. The data relating to properties not meeting standards cannot be readily extracted from records in the sort of detail that you have requested. However, I can advise that 1921 hazards were removed during the course of the scheme. 652 properties were made safer in the event of a fire and 520 HMOs received improved kitchen and bathroom amenities. 317 HMOs received security improvements and 282 received affordable warmth improvements.
6. Tenants of unlicensed HMOs can take civil action at the Residential Property Tribunal to recover up to one year's rent where their landlord has been convicted of an offence for failure to obtain a licence. We are aware that at least one group of tenants has done so, but this is not a process in which the Council has any involvement and, therefore, the number of such claims is not recorded.

TRANSPORT, PLANNING AND SUSTAINABILITY  
(COUNCILLOR RAMESH PATEL)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOYLE

Since the new, enhanced, parking metres were installed in the city centre, how many of the machines have at some point failed and for how many hours in total have they been out of operation?

Using an indicative, average hourly charge, how much revenue has been lost?

Will the council be recompensed for loss of revenue?

Reply

This issue relates to the card payment provider that the new machines use to process card and contactless payments. The machines themselves were still able to take cash payments. There were also other machines and payment options available in the area affected for customers to use.

The machines are made and provided by Metric; however, they use software provided by Capita to process the card payments and it was this software that failed on the days in question, not the new machines.

Capita is the Council's corporate payment provider, but are new into this particular field of card payments for pay & display machines (there are only four approved card payment providers/acquires in this field). Only two of these providers/acquires are accredited/approved to process contactless payments for pay & display machines and, therefore, it made sense to align with our corporate provider.

The 50 new machines were offline for card payments on Friday 9 December 2016 and came back online during Saturday 10 December 2016. This is affected the 12 hours for when payments are made from 8am to 8pm on the Friday. (Approximately 50 machines x 12 hours = 600 hours as the machines came back online at slightly different times when the patch/fix was applied).

The 50 new machines also went offline for card payments from 25-28 December 2016 due to a different issue with the card payment processing software. (Approximately 50 machines x 12 hours x 4 days = 2,400 hours as the machines came back online at slightly different times when the patch/fix was applied).

The figures below show that there has been a minimal drop in revenue received when compared with the same period last year as other payment options and machines were still available for people to use.

	<b>Cash Payments</b>	<b>Card Payments</b>	<b>Total</b>
December 2015	£231,123	£172,668	£403,791
	57%	43%	
December 2016	£220,643	£180,162	£400,805
	55%	45%	

The Council cannot pinpoint that the issue with the machines was the sole cause for the small difference in income, as there were also a spate of thefts and damage from machines at the beginning of December 2016, which also had a small impact.

The Council therefore has no grounds to claim any recompense.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR REA

What is the breakdown of the number of traffic incidents on each City Road and Albany Road in the past five years, by year and whether the incidents resulted in injury?

Reply

The breakdown of recorded injury collisions is shown below:

City Road	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total
Recorded Injury Collisions	3	5	3	11	5	27

Breakdown of the above totals					
<i>Slight</i>	2	5	3	8	5
<i>Serious</i>	1	-	-	3	-
<i>Fatal</i>	-	-	-	-	-

Albany Road	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total
Recorded Injury Collisions	5	7	2	6	4	24
Breakdown of the above totals						
<i>Slight</i>	5	6	1	5	4	
<i>Serious</i>	-	1	1	1	-	
<i>Fatal</i>	-	-	-	-	-	

The Council does not hold records of non-injury (damage only) collisions. However, these are held by the Police, but we do not have access to this data.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR KELLOWAY

On 15 September 2016 it was reported that Cardiff Council was installing 50 new contactless payment machines for parking and a new app called Mi Permit. How much did it cost the Council to install the new machines, including actual cost of machines, labour and disposal of old parking machines?

How much did the Mi Permit app cost?

Reply

The cost of 50 new pay & display machines was £220k, including installation costs. The old machines were sold back to the supplier for £10k. The new machines also have screens on which we have sold advertising space for £75k in income over the next 3 years.

The new machines have contactless payment facilities, along with normal card payment and cash payment facilities, and have faster transaction speeds to improve the customer experience.

There are no upfront costs for the Mi Permit App; however, a 10p convenience charge is levied per transaction when customers pay for parking. The Council has taken the decision to absorb this cost from the current parking tariffs paid by customers using the App.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR KELLOWAY

How much car parking revenue was lost due to the closure of Park Place on the car free day in Park Place in 2016 and were buses able to go down the road?

Reply

Approximately 130 parking bays were non-operational on 22 September 2016, which resulted in a loss of income of approximately £600 to £700 for the day.

The area was closed off to all vehicles; therefore, buses did not have access along Park Place.

*(The meeting concluded at 23.05)*